

First Round Flops by Tony Villiotti

There is nothing worse than having your favorite team's first round draft choice turn out to be a flop. Every team experiences it but that doesn't make it any easier to accept.

Flop in this context, of course, is a relative term. There is too much money invested in a first rounder for any of them to be cut in their first training camp. Many first round selections do not perform up to expectations, though, and those who are significantly below those expectations can fairly be called a flop.

These flops occur for a variety of reasons - - injury issues, off-the field issues, attitude issues or just a plain misevaluation of talent.

In advance of the upcoming draft, **DRAFTMETRICS** thought it would be interesting to take a look at the worst flops for each draft position (1 through 32) for the 1991 through 2010 drafts. The reason for the player's lack of performance was taken into consideration, with players who suffered a career-ending injury judged a little less harshly than players who flopped for other reasons. One player (Leon Bender, the 31st pick in 1998 for the Raiders) passed away from a seizure disorder before reporting to camp. As a matter of respect, **DRAFTMETRICS** did not list him as a flop.

Following is the **DRAFTMETRICS** list of top flops by draft position.

Pick #	Player & Position	Drafted By	Year	Pick #	Player & Position	Drafted By	Year
1	Kijana Carter, RB	Bengals	1995	17	Jarvis Moss, DE	Broncos	2007
2	Charles Rogers, WR	Lions	2003	18	Bobby Carpenter, LB	Cowboys	2006
3	Bruce Pickens, DB	Falcons	1991	19	Tony Smith, RB	Falcons	1992
4	Desmond Howard, WR	Redskins	1992	20	Aaron Ross, DB	Giants	2007
5	Trev Alberts, LB	Colts	1994	21	Sylvester Morris, WR	Chiefs	2000
6	Johnathan Sullivan, DT	Saints	2003	22	Stan Thomas, OT	Bears	1991
7	Troy Williamson, WR	Vikings	2005	23	Rashard Anderson, DB	Panthers	2000
8	David Terrell, WR	Bears	2001	24	Leonard Renfro, DT	Eagles	1993
9	Reggie Williams, WR	Jaguars	2004	25	Jon Harris, DE	Eagles	1997
10	Jamal Reynolds, DE	Packers	2001	26	Jim Druckenmiller, QB	49ers	1997
11	Michael Booker, DB	Falcons	1997	27	Todd Kelly, DE	49ers	1993
12	Wendell Bryant, DT	Cardinals	2002	28	Andre Woolfolk, DB	Titans	2003
13	Eugene Chung, OT	Patriots	1992	29	Dimitrius Underwood, DE	Vikings	1999
14	Bernard Williams, OT	Eagles	1997	30	Andre Johnson, OT	Redskins	1996
15	Huey Richardson, LB	Steelers	1991	31	Rashaun Woods, WR	49ers	2004
16	Justin Harrell, DT	Packers	2007	32	Nathan Davis, DT	Falcons	1997

The Falcons (4), 49ers (3) and Eagles (3) have the most players on the flop list. The Bills, Browns, Bucs, Chargers, Dolphins, Jets, Rams, Ravens, Seahawks and Texans all have no players on the list.

On the following pages, **DRAFTMETRICS** has listed all the players who were considered for inclusion on the flop list and some of the reasoning for selecting the “winner.” Only the Ravens and Texans avoided having any players considered for inclusion. The Bears (6), 49ers (5) and Eagles (5) had the most players considered.

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
1	Steve Emtman	Washington	DT	1992	Colts	Kijana Carter
	Kijana Carter	Penn State	RB	1995	Bengals	
	Jamarcus Russell	Louisiana State	QB	2007	Raiders	
	Both Carter and Emtman were plagued by injury in their careers. The Bengals traded up to get Carter and, while he kicked around the NFL for 7 seasons, he only rushed for a little over 1100 yards in his career. Emtman played 6 seasons and started 19 games. If Russell's career is over he may end up being the winner here.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
2	Ryan Leaf	Washington State	QB	1998	Chargers	Charles Rogers
	Charles Rogers	Michigan State	WR	2003	Lions	
	While the Leaf selection gets most of the publicity, the Rogers selection was even worse. He started nine games over 3 seasons and had problems passing drug tests. He even had to pay back some of his bonus money when a judge ruled his drug use violated his contract.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
3	Bruce Pickens	Nebraska	DB	1991	Falcons	Bruce Pickens
	Heath Shuler	Tennessee	QB	1994	Redskins	
	Akili Smith	Oregon	QB	1999	Bengals	
	Pickens started only 9 nine over his NFL career and was trade by the Falcons during his 3 rd season. Shuler started 22 games in his career, passing for 3700 yards and was intercepted 33 times. Smith started 17 games and threw for about 2200 yards.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
4	Desmond Howard	Michigan	WR	1992	Redskins	Desmond Howard
	Mike Williams	Texas	OT	2002	Bills	
	The #4 draft position has been a pretty successful one and there have been no outright busts. The two candidates were the worst of the selections. Williams was a starter for his first three seasons then lost his job and was cut. After being out of football for a couple of seasons, he signed with the Redskins and started some games in 2009 but couldn't play in 2010 for health issues. Howard played 11 seasons in the NFL and made 1 Pro Bowl, but was used most extensively as a kick returner (123 receptions for his career). You don't use your #4 pick for a return guy.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
5	Trev Alberts	Nebraska	LB	1994	Colts	Trev Alberts
	Cedric Jones	Oklahoma	DE	1996	Giants	
	Curtis Enis	Penn State	RB	1998	Bears	
	The Colts traded up to get Alberts who lasted only 3 seasons in the NFL. Slowed by injury, he started a total of 7 games. After a slow start to his career, Jones was a full-time starter for 2 seasons but his career lasted only 5 seasons. Injuries reduced Enis' career to 3 seasons. He was a starter for one year, rushing for over 900 yards. Close call, but the edge has to go to Alberts over Enis.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
6	Lawrence Phillips	Nebraska	RB	1996	Rams	Johnathan Sullivan
	Johnathan Sullivan	Georgia	DT	2003	Saints	
	Vernon Gholston	Ohio State	DE	2008	Jets	
	The Rams traded Jerome Bettis when they drafted Phillips. Phillips, dogged by character issues dating back to his college and continuing as a pro and even after, played only 3 seasons and rushed for about 1500 yards. Sullivan was a starter as a rookie and made the All-Rookie team but was out of the league two years later after being traded to New England. Gholston is still active for the Jets, but has yet to show the abilities that led to his being drafted. This is a tough one to call, but Sullivan is the choice.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
7	Charles McRae	Tennessee	OT	1991	Bucs	Troy Williamson
	Byron Leftwich	Marshall	QB	2003	Jaguars	
	Troy Williamson	South Carolina	WR	2005	Vikings	
	Most of the #7 selections have been pretty successful and even the nominees have not been outright busts. McRae played for 6 seasons and started 39 games in his career. Leftwich was a starter for his first 3 seasons and has served in a backup role since, now with the Steelers. Williamson caught 87 passes in his 5 year career and had trouble holding onto the ball. He's the choice.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
8	Tim Biakabutuka	Michigan	RB	1996	Panthers	David Terrell
	David Terrell	Michigan	WR	2001	Bears	Terrell
	Biakabutuka was troubled by injuries but did rush for 3300 yards in his 6 year career. Terrell caught 128 passes in his 5 year career but was released by the Bears after they signed Muhsin Muhammad. Again, neither were outright terrible but Terrell gets the nod.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
9	Reggie Williams	Washington	WR	2004	Jaguars	Reggie Williams
	Ted Ginn	Ohio State	WR	2007	Dolphins	
	Another draft position that has been very successful. Williams had an up and down career, with 189 receptions in his 5 seasons, plus some off the field problems. Ginn has not lived up to his potential but is still active and maybe someday he will. No outright busts at this draft position, but Williams is probably the chief underperformer.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
10	Jamal Reynolds	Florida State	DE	2001	Packers	Jamal Reynolds
	Mike Williams	USC	WR	2005	Lions	
	Matt Leinart	USC	QB	2006	Cardinals	
	Reynolds is the definition of an absolute bust. He played 3 seasons and never started a game. Williams had a terrible time with the Lions but, after a two year absence from the NFL, signed with the Seahawks and shows signs of resurrecting his career. Leinart has been terrible so far and couldn't even make the Cardinals roster after Kurt Warner's retirement. He was a backup in 2010 with the Texans. Reynolds for now, but Leinart could end up being the worst.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
11	Michael Booker	Nebraska	DB	1997	Falcons	Michael Booker
	Ron Dayne	Wisconsin	RB	2000	Giants	
	Aaron Maybin	Penn State	DE	2009	Bills	
	Booker played 5 years and started only 10 games. Dayne never lived up to his reputation although he did rush for 3700 yards. Maybin still has time to turn it around, but he was drafted for his pass rushing ability and has yet to register a sack in his two NFL seasons. We'll go with Booker and give Maybin the benefit of the doubt, for now.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
12	Patrick Bates	Texas A&M	DB	1993	Raiders	Wendell Bryant
	Cade McNown	UCLA	QB	1999	Bears	
	Wendell Bryant	Wisconsin	DT	2002	Cardinals	
	Bates played 3 seasons and started 18 games. McNown saw action early in his career but never appeared in a game after his sophomore season. He threw for 3100 yards in his career and posted a 3-12 record as a starter. Bryant started 9 games in his 3 seasons, was then suspended for a year for substance abuse and never played again.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
13	Eugene Chung	Virginia Tech	OT	1992	Patriots	Eugene Chung
	Troy Edwards	Louisiana Tech	WR	1999	Steelers	
	Eugene Chung's claim to fame is that he was the first player of Asian descent to be selected in the first round of the NFL draft. He started his first two seasons then never started another game. Edwards best season was his rookie season when he caught 61 passes. He was primarily a role player in his 7 NFL seasons, with 203 receptions to his credit. Close, but Chung gets the nod.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
14	Bernard Williams	Georgia	OT	1997	Eagles	Bernard Williams
	Jason Peter	Nebraska	DT	1998	Panthers	
	Michael Haynes	Penn State	DE	2003	Bears	
	Williams was a starter as a rookie but was then banned from the NFL after failing 15 (yes 15) drug tests. Injuries slowed Peter's career and played only 4 seasons, starting 20 games. Haynes was just a flat out bust, starting 4 games in his 3 NFL seasons. Another close call, but the edge goes to Williams.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
15	Huey Richardson	Florida	LB	1991	Steelers	Huey Richardson
	Yatil Green	Miami (FL)	WR	1997	Dolphins	
	Jerome McDougle	Miami (FL)	DE	2003	Eagles	
	Richardson played only 2 seasons and didn't start a game. Green missed his first two seasons with knee injuries and played in only 1 season, with 10 surgeries on one knee effectively ending his career. McDougle played 4 seasons without starting a game. Plenty to choose from here, but we'll give Green somewhat of a pass due to his injury and pick Richardson.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
16	Dan McGwire	San Diego State	QB	1991	Seahawks	Justin Harrell
	William Green	Boston College	RB	2002	Browns	
	Justin Harrell	Tennessee	DT	2007	Packers	
	McGwire hung around for 5 NFL seasons, but started a total of only 5 games. Green showed some promise in his first 3 seasons, rushing for 2000 yards, but injuries ended his 4 th season and his NFL career. Harrell has also been hampered by injuries appearing in only 14 games with 2 starts in 3 seasons. Harrell could recover and prove us wrong but he's the choice for now.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
17	Bobby Wilson	Michigan State	DT	1991	Redskins	Jarvis Moss
	David Pollack	Georgia	DE	2005	Bengals	
	Jarvis Moss	Florida	DE	2007	Broncos	
	Wilson played 4 years in the NFL and started 24 games. Pollack's career was ended prematurely due to a serious injury in his second season. Moss was released by the Broncos during the 2010 season after starting 1 game in 4 seasons and was picked up by the Raiders. Have to go with Moss until he proves us wrong.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
18	Dana Hall	Washington	DB	1992	49ers	Bobby Carpenter
	Ernest Dye	South Carolina	OT	1993	Cardinals	
	Bobby Carpenter	Ohio State	LB	2006	Cowboys	
	Hall played 6 seasons and started 38 games. Dye also played 6 seasons and recorded 23 starts. Carpenter takes the prize here with 7 starts in his 5 NFL seasons, though he is still playing.					

Pick #	Candidate	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
19	Tony Smith	Southern Mississippi	RB	1992	Falcons	Tony Smith
	Smith played only 3 seasons and rushed for 485 yards. To make matters worse, he is the consideration received for Bret Favre. Aside from Smith, 19 th picks have done pretty well so there were no other candidates.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
20	Kenechi Udeze	USC	DE	2004	Vikings	Aaron Ross
	Aaron Ross	Texas	DB	2007	Giants	
	Really a tough one to call as there were no outright flops at this draft position. Udeze played 4 seasons and started 47 games before contracting a form of leukemia. Ross started most of his first 2 season then missed much of 2009 with an injury. In 2010 he couldn't regain his starting job and was the Giants' #3 corner. Ross is the choice.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
21	Vaughn Dunbar	Indiana	RB	1992	Saints	Sylvester Morris
	Rashaan Salaam	Colorado	RB	1995	Bears	
	Sylvester Morris	Jackson State	WR	2000	Chiefs	
	Dunbar ran for 935 yards in 3 NFL seasons. Salaam had a big rookie season, rushing for 1000 yards, but played only 4 seasons as he developed injury and fumbling issues. Morris started 14 games in his only NFL season but injuries cut his career short. Have to go with Morris.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
22	Stan Thomas	Texas	OT	1991	Bears	Stan Thomas
	Chris McIntosh	Wisconsin	OT	2000	Seahawks	
	Brady Quinn	Notre Dame	QB	2007	Browns	
	Thomas played 4 seasons and started only 7 games. McIntosh started 10 games as a rookie, then developed a recurring neck injury that ultimately led to his retirement. Quinn has done very little as a pro, though he is still active. Heart says Quinn, head says Thomas.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
23	Shante Carver	Arizona State	DE	1994	Cowboys	Rashard Anderson
	Rashard Anderson	Jackson State	DB	2000	Panthers	
	Marcus Tubbs	Texas	DT	2004	Seahawks	
	Carver played 4 seasons for the Cowboys, including 1 as a starter. Anderson played 2 years and then sat out 2 seasons for substance abuse. He was released at the end of his suspension. Tubbs played 3 seasons with the Seahawks before knee issues ended his career. Anderson is the choice.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
24	Todd Marinovich	USC	QB	1991	Raiders	Leonard Renfro
	Leonard Renfro	Colorado	DT	1993	Eagles	
	Reggie McGrew	Florida	DT	1999	49ers	
	Marinovich was a high profile draft choice who played only 2 years, starting 8 games. Renfro played 2 years and started only 2 games. McGrew lasted 3 years and never started a game. It's tempting to go with Marinovich here because of his high profile but, in all fairness, the other guys were even bigger flops. Renfro in a close one.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
25	Billy Milner	Houston	OT	1995	Dolphins	Jon Harris
	Jon Harris	Virginia	DE	1997	Eagles	
	Freddie Mitchell	UCLA	WR	2001	Eagles	
	Milner made the All-Rookie team but suffered a career ending neck injury in his third season. Harris played 2 seasons and started a total of 8 games. Mitchell played only 4 seasons and started 17 games, nabbing 90 receptions. Harris is the choice.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
26	Jim Druckenmiller	Virginia Tech	QB	1997	49ers	Jim Druckenmiller
	Erik Flowers	Arizona State	DE	2000	Bills	
	Chris Perry	Michigan	RB	2004	Bengals	
	Druckenmiller played 2 seasons and passed for 239 yards for his career. Flowers played 5 seasons but started only 6 games while playing for 3 NFL teams. Perry played 4 seasons and started 9 games. He rushed for 600 yards and had 500 receiving yards in his career. Any of the 3 would make sense, but we'll go with Druckenmiller.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
27	Todd Kelly	Tennessee	DE	1993	49ers	Todd Kelly
	John Michels	USC	OT	1996	Packers	
	Rae Carruth	Colorado	WR	1997	Panthers	
	Kelly lasted 4 unproductive years in the NFL, starting 6 games. Michels played only 2 seasons due to knee problems but was a starter for GB in the 1996 Super Bowl. He was traded for Jon Harris, another first round flop, but never recovered from his knee injury. Carruth started as a rookie but two years later was in prison convicted of conspiracy to murder his pregnant girl friend. Nod to Kelly.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
28	Andy Katzenmoyer	Ohio State	LB	1999	Patriots	Andre Woolfolk
	Andre Woolfolk	Oklahoma	DB	2003	Titans	
	A neck injury ended Katzenmoyer's career after only 2 seasons, after he earned a starting job as a rookie. Woolfolk played 4 seasons but started only 11 games. Another close call, we go with Woolfolk.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
29	John Avery	Mississippi	RB	1998	Dolphins	Dimitrius Underwood
	Dimitrius Underwood	Michigan State	DE	1999	Vikings	
	R Jay Soward	USC	WR	2000	Jaguars	
	Avery played only 3 seasons and rushed for 524 yards, 503 of those in his rookie season. Underwood walked out of camp the day after signing his contract and was subsequently released by the Vikings. He ended up playing 2 seasons in the NFL but mental health issues ended his abbreviated career. Soward played only 1 season due to alcohol issues. How do you decide between Underwood and Soward? Soward did manage to start 2 games so we'll go with Underwood.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
30	Craig Powell	Ohio State	LB	1995	Browns	Andre Johnson
	Andre Johnson	Penn State	OT	1996	Redskins	
	Marcus Nash	Tennessee	WR	1998	Broncos	
	Powell played 3 seasons and never started a game. Johnson did not appear in a game as a rookie and was cut before the next season. He played 2 NFL seasons. Nash saw very little playing time for the Broncos as a rookie and was traded the following season, then was released almost immediately. He played 2 seasons and started 1 game. Any of these guys would be good choices, but we went with Johnson.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
31	Trezelle Jenkins	Michigan	OT	1995	Chiefs	Rashaun Woods
	Rick Terry	North Carolina	DT	1997	Jets	
	Rashaun Woods	Oklahoma State	WR	2004	49ers	
	Leon Bender was drafted by the Raiders and died from a seizure disorder 5 weeks later. As a matter of respect he will not be considered here. Jenkins played in 9 games during his 3 year career, starting 1. Terry played 3 seasons and started 3 games. Woods played only as a rookie, catching 7 passes. He was on the IR his second season with a hand injury. He was traded to the Chargers, who released him. Woods is our guy.					

Pick #	Candidates	College	Pos	Year	Team	The Winner
32	Eric Mahlum	California	G	1994	Colts	Nathan Davis
	Leeland McElroy	Texas A&M	RB	1996	Cardinals	
	Nathan Davis	Indiana	DT	1997	Falcons	
	Mahlum played only 3 seasons but did start 18 games. McElroy played 2 seasons and rushed for 729 yards. His started the first game of his rookie season but was released by the Cardinals before what would have been his 3 rd season. Davis played only 2 seasons, had weight problems and never started a game. Davis is the pick.					